

(A) Gottschalk on I Timothy 2:4

Gottschalk (c.808–c.868) in Victor Genke and Francis X. Gumerlock (eds. & trans.), *Gottschalk and a Medieval Predestination Controversy: Texts Translated From the Latin* (Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 2010):

[1] “All those whom God wills to be saved (1 Tm 2:4) are without doubt saved, nor can any be saved but those God wills to be saved. Nor is there any one whom God wills to be saved, and is not saved, since our God has done all things whatever he willed (Ps 134:6). They therefore are all saved—all whom he wills to be saved” (p. 66).

[2] “All’ and ‘every’ have to be understood, that is, as all who are saved, about whom the Apostle says: Who wills all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4), and all who are not saved, whom God does not will to be saved” (p. 67).

[3] “It is said of all the members of Christ: All the ends of the world will remember and turn to the Lord. And all the families of the nations will worship in his sight, for the kingdom is the Lord’s, and he will rule over the nations (Ps 21:28-29). And all kings of the earth will worship him; all the nations will serve him (Ps 71:11), and: All the nations that you have made will come and worship before you, Lord, and will glorify your name (Ps 85:9), and: Therefore all died, and he died for all (2 Cor 5:14-15), and: He handed him over for us all (Rom. 8:32), and: Who will all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4) ...” (pp. 120-121).

[4] “God saves by this salvation those upon whom he has mercy in his great goodness, not those whom he hardens with no iniquity. He nonetheless does both by his equally pious and just will and by his most omnipotent power. For the Apostle does not say: He has mercy on whom he wills and hardens whom he does not will, but: He has mercy on whom he wills, and hardens whom he wills (Rom 9:18). Hence, those who want the words of the Apostle: God wills all men to be saved [I Tim. 2:4], to be understood in general both for the elect and for the reprobate, but he saves the elect because they themselves will to be saved, and on the contrary he does not save the reprobate because they do not will to be, can most easily be refuted by the one syllable by which is said: He hardens whom he wills (Rom 9:18). For God truly by no means willed to save with eternal salvation those whom he on that account, as scripture testifies, justly hardens because he wills, not because he does not will. Here let them wake up, if they can, who thus far have not been afraid to believe this and also are not afraid even now. And if they do not blush for shame at what the Lord God said to Moses: I will have mercy on whom I will have mercy, and I will have compassion on whom I will have compassion, and I will be gracious to whom I will be pleased (Ex 33:19)—he did not say: ‘To him who pleases me’—or at what the psalmist said: Great are works of the Lord, sought out in all his wills (Ps 110:2), and: The Lord has done whatever he willed in heaven and on earth, in the sea and in all the deeps (Ps 134:6) ...” (pp. 144-145).

[5] “God does not will that all men be saved, but only those who are saved. And in the words of the Apostle: Who wills all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4), ‘all’ means only all those who are saved” (p. 173).

[6] “[Gottschalk] says, as the old predestinarians also said, that ‘God does not will all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4), but only those who are saved; however, all those are saved whom he willed to save and for this reason whoever is not saved absolutely do not belong to that will that they be saved. Since if all those whom God wills to be saved are not saved, he has not done whatever he willed, and if he wills what he cannot do, he is not omnipotent, but weak. But he is omnipotent who has done whatever he willed, as the scripture says: The Lord has done whatever he willed in heaven and on earth, in the sea and in all the deeps (Ps 134:6) ...” (pp. 176-177).

[7] “[Gottschalk] says that God does not will all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4), but only those who are saved, but that all are saved whom he willed to save, and for this reason that all those who are not saved did not pertain to that will that they be saved. Scripture says: The Lord has done whatever he willed in heaven and on earth, in the sea and in all the deeps (Ps 134:6); In your will, Lord, all things have been placed, and there is no one who is able to resist your will (Est 13:9). Therefore, he does not will all to be saved, but only those who are saved, because if he wills what he cannot do, he is not omnipotent” (p. 179).

(B) The Views of Gottschalk, as Set Forth (Accurately) **by Rabanus Maurus (an Enemy)** (*Letter to Pope Nicholas*; pp. 176-177)

[Double Predestination] He says, as the old predestinarians also said, that as God predestined some to eternal life, so he also predestined some to eternal death.

[Against the Well-Meant Offer] He says, as the old predestinarians also said, that “God does not *will all men to be saved* (I Tm 2:4), but only those who are saved; however, all those are saved whom he willed to save and for this reason whoever is not saved absolutely do not belong to that will that they be saved. Since if all those whom God wills to be saved are not saved, he has not done whatever he willed, and if he wills what he cannot do, he is not omnipotent, but weak. But he is omnipotent who has done whatever he willed, as the scripture says: *The Lord has done whatever he willed in heaven and on earth, in the sea and in all the deeps* [Ps. 135:6] ...”

[Particular Redemption] He says, as the old predestinarians also said, that our Lord and Savior Jesus Christ was crucified and died not for the redemption of the whole world, that is, not for the salvation and redemption of all men, but only for those who are saved ...

[Preservation of the Saints] And in another place that same Gottschalk also writes: “God forbid that I should ever want even to dream or only to whisper that the ancient serpent might be able to carry off with him into eternal perdition any of those for whose redemption such precious blood of our Lord his Son has been poured out to God the Father. Amen.”

(C) Gottschalk on the Children of the Promise (*On Predestination*; pp. 132-133)

Since it is clear, let no one of sound mind doubt that all the reprobate, that is, not only the heathens but also all baptized Christians, are children of perdition, for the Lord says about the baptized Judas: *None of them has perished except the son of perdition* (Jn 17:12), and all the elect are children of the promise, for the Apostle says: *The children of the promise are counted in the seed* (Rom 9:8), but the same seed is surely Christ, since the Apostle says: *And to your seed, which is Christ* (Gal 3:16). Moreover, Christ and the church, like bridegroom and bride, are undoubtedly one and the same person; and for this reason not only Christ is the head of the church, but also the church itself as the body and members of its head is said to be and is Christ, as the Apostle says: *For as the body is one and has many members, but all the members of that one body, although they are many, are one body, so also is Christ* (1 Cor 12:12). And again he says: *And if you belong to Christ, then you are Abraham's seed* (Gal 3:29), that is *you are Christ*. Since this is so, it ought of course to be most certain for all catholics that what blessed Augustine says is absolutely true: “For the children of the promise do not perish, but the children of perdition, for if the body of Christ,” that is, the Christian people, “would perish, then Christ would also truly perish. Let these false brethren and false Christians perish, as they deserve. The members and the body of Christ certainly will not perish” ...

If, when you can, you carefully and intelligently read these things out of a love for the truth, as is fitting for a son of truth, you will surely obtain and acquire a great advantage for your mind, with God's gratuitous help. For since God the Father says in the same psalm: *But I will not take from him my mercy, nor will I harm him in my truth. I will not profane my covenant, nor will I render void the words that proceed from my lips. Once I have sworn by my holiness; I will not lie to David. His seed shall endure forever, and his throne like the sun before me and like the moon perfect forever and a faithful witness in the sky* (Ps 88:34-38).